



Thomas C. Horne
Attorney General

Office of the Attorney General
State of Arizona
CRIMINAL APPEALS/CAPITAL LITIGATION
SECTION

Susanne Bartlett Blomo
Assistant Attorney General
susanne.blomo@azag.gov

May11, 2012

The Hon. Molly Dwyer, Clerk
United States Court of Appeals
For the Ninth Circuit
95 – 7th Street
P.O. Box 193939
San Francisco, California 94103

Re: *Samuel Villegas Lopez* v. Charles Ryan, et. al., No. 12-99001
United States District Court No. CIV 98–0072–PHX-SMM

Dear Ms. Dwyer:

Pursuant to Rule 28(f) and Circuit Rule 28–6 of the Federal Rules of Procedure, Respondents advise the Court of the following supplemental authority for the above case, set for oral argument on May 14, 2012, in San Francisco, California.

Respondents' answering brief, at page 17, argues that there is no close connection between *Martinez*¹ and this Court's opinion in *Lopez* because *Lopez* does not rest on procedural default. Moreover, at page 25, Respondents' answering brief argues that this Court's opinion in *Lopez*—ruling on the merits of Claim 1(C) (as exhausted) and holding that, under 28 U.S.C. § 28–2254(e)(2), *Lopez* was barred from an evidentiary hearing or expansion of the record to present additional evidence—was a merits ruling. *Lopez*'s reply brief, at page 17, argues that *Martinez* and § 2254(e) are inextricably intertwined. In support of Respondent's arguments and in response to *Lopez*'s argument, Respondents additionally cite *Cullen v. Pinholster*, 131 S.Ct. 1388, 1398–1400 (2011), and *Schad v. Ryan*, 671 F.3d 708, 722 (9th Cir. 2011), which were both decided after this Court's opinion in this case, *Lopez v. Ryan*, 630 F.3d 1198 (9th Cir. 2011).

¹ *Martinez v. Ryan*, 132 S.Ct.1309 (2012).

Hon. Molly Dwyer

Lopez v. Ryan

May 11, 2012

Page 2 of 2

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Sincerely,

/s/

SUSANNE BARTLETT BLOMO

Assistant Attorney General

cc via email:

Kelley J. Henry

Kelley_henry@fd.org

Denise I. Young

Dyoung3@mindspring.com

Attorneys for PETITIONER-APPELLANT

Margaret Epler

Margaret_Epler@ca9.uscourts.gov

Howard Hom

Howard_Hom@ca9.uscourts.gov

SBB:el

2695790