

**No. 17-72917**

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT**

*In re* UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, *et al.*,

Petitioners.

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA; DONALD J. TRUMP, President of the United States; U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY; and ELAINE DUKE, Acting Secretary of Homeland Security,

Petitioners-Defendants,

v.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA,

Respondent,

REGENTS OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA; JANET NAPOLITANO, President of the University of California; STATE OF CALIFORNIA; STATE OF MAINE; STATE OF MARYLAND; STATE OF MINNESOTA; COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA; SEIU LOCAL 521; CITY OF SAN JOSE; DULCE GARCIA; MIRIAM GONZALEZ AVILA; SAUL JIMENEZ SUAREZ; VIRIDIANA CHABOLLA MENDOZA; NORMA RAMIREZ; and JIRAYUT LATTHIVONGSKORN,

Real Parties in Interest-Plaintiffs.

**REAL PARTIES IN INTEREST'S OPPOSITION TO PETITIONERS' STATEMENT OF RELATED CASES**

Jeffrey M. Davidson (SBN 248620)  
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP  
One Front Street, 35th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111-5356  
Telephone: (415) 591-6000

*Attorneys for Real Parties in Interest-Plaintiffs  
The Regents of the University of California  
and Janet Napolitano, in her official capacity  
as President of the University of California*

GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP  
Theodore J. Boutrous, Jr. (SBN 132099)  
333 South Grand Avenue  
Los Angeles, CA 90071-3197  
Telephone: (213) 229-7000

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs Dulce Garcia, Miriam  
Gonzalez Avila, Saul Jimenez Suarez,  
Viridiana Chabolla Mendoza, Norma Ramirez,  
and Jirayut Latthivongskorn*

Xavier Becerra  
Attorney General of California  
1515 Clay Street, 20th Floor  
P.O. Box 70550  
Oakland, CA 94612-0550  
Telephone: (510) 879-1247

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of California*

Joseph W. Cotchett (SBN 36324)  
COTCHETT, PITRE & McCARTHY, LLP  
San Francisco Airport Office Center  
840 Malcolm Road, Suite 200  
Burlingame, CA 94010  
Telephone: (650) 697-6000

*Attorneys for Plaintiff City of San Jose*

[Additional Counsel Listed on Signature Page]

## OPPOSITION TO STATEMENT OF RELATED CASES

The government identifies *In re Thomas E. Price*, No. 17-71121, as a related case, but that case does not satisfy any of the criteria for related cases under Ninth Circuit Rule 28-2.6.

The government in this case raises numerous issues and arguments that are entirely distinct from those raised in *In re Thomas E. Price* and that will not be decided in that case. These include: (i) the government's claim that the district court should dismiss the case for either lack of jurisdiction under 8 U.S.C. §1252(g) or because the decision at issue is an unreviewable exercise of prosecutorial discretion (Pet. at 15-16); (ii) the government's claim that depositions of high-ranking government officials are categorically inappropriate (Pet. at 21-22); (iii) the government's complaint about the particular balancing conducted by the district court in overruling the government's assertion of deliberative process privilege as to certain documents (Pet. at 22-23); (iv) the district court's finding that the government waived the attorney-client privilege as to materials bearing on DACA's legality (Pet. at 23-24); (v) the district court's rejection of the government's claims of executive privilege as to certain documents (Pet. at 24); (vi) the government's claim that discovery should be limited with respect to claims of discriminatory motive (Pet. at 24-26); and (vii) the government's claim that special consideration should be given because this case implicates White House

decision-makers (Pet. at 17, 26). None of these issues is raised in the *In re Thomas E. Price* case.

Any similarity between the issues concerning how to approach the administrative record in the two cases (Pet. at 5-6), is not reason to relate the cases. First, there is no factual overlap in the two cases—the plaintiffs, federal defendants, facts, and legal claims are distinct. Second, any similarity in legal issues is overwhelmed by the distinctions discussed above. Third, the analysis in each case will turn on the unique states of the respective administrative records that were before each of the district courts and, in particular, on the sources of the record materials. The administrative proceeding at issue in *In re Thomas E. Price*—although lengthy and scientifically complex—was a conventional FDA proceeding, of the sort the FDA routinely conducts under its regulatory authority, to decide whether to approve the introduction of a new type of food (genetically engineered salmon) into interstate commerce. Here, by contrast, the decision to rescind DACA was the result of a highly unusual process. The decision was made in a highly-publicized effort led by the White House, in which the Attorney General provided legal advice to the Acting Secretary of DHS, who then issued the formal memorandum rescinding DACA. Fourth, unlike *In re Thomas E. Price*, this case involves constitutional claims, which alters the nature of the analysis

because the documents at issue with respect to the administrative record will be subject to being produced through discovery.

Finally, no argument has been set in *In re Thomas E. Price*, so no efficiency would be gained by treating the cases as related given the emergency nature of the government's motion here and the expedited scheduling order under which this case is proceeding in the district court.

Dated: October 23, 2017

Xavier Becerra  
Attorney General of California  
Edward C. Dumont  
Solicitor General  
Michael J. Mongan  
Deputy Solicitor General  
Michael L. Newman  
Supervising Deputy Attorney General  
James F. Zahradka II  
Deputy Attorney General  
Kathleen Vermazen Radez  
Deputy Attorney General  
455 Golden Gate Ave., Suite 11000  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
(415) 703-2548

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of  
California*

Respectfully submitted,  
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP

s/ Jeffrey M. Davidson  
Jeffrey M. Davidson  
Alan Bersin  
One Front Street, 35th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111-5356  
Telephone: (415) 591-6000  
Facsimile: (415) 591-6091  
Email: [jdavidsn@cov.com](mailto:jdavidsn@cov.com)  
[abersin@cov.com](mailto:abersin@cov.com)

Lanny A. Breuer  
Mark H. Lynch  
Alexander A. Berengaut  
Megan A. Crowley  
One CityCenter  
850 Tenth Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20001-4956  
Telephone: (202) 662-6000  
Facsimile: (202) 662-6291  
E-mail: [lbreuer@cov.com](mailto:lbreuer@cov.com),  
[mlynch@cov.com](mailto:mlynch@cov.com),  
[aberengaut@cov.com](mailto:aberengaut@cov.com),  
[mcrowley@cov.com](mailto:mcrowley@cov.com),

Lori Swanson  
Attorney General  
Julianna F. Passe  
Assistant Attorney General  
State of Minnesota  
445 Minnesota Street, Suite 1100  
St. Paul, Minnesota 55101-2128  
Telephone: (651) 757-1136  
Email:  
julianna.passe@ag.state.mn.us

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of  
Minnesota*

Janet T. Mills  
Attorney General of Maine  
Susan P. Herman  
Deputy Attorney General  
6 State House Station  
Augusta, Maine 04333  
Telephone: (207) 626-8814  
Email: susan.herman@maine.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Maine*

Brian E. Frosh  
Attorney General of Maryland  
Steven M. Sullivan  
Solicitor General  
200 Saint Paul Place, 20th Floor  
Baltimore, Maryland 21202  
Telephone: (410) 576-6325  
Email: ssullivan@oag.state.md.us

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of  
Maryland*

Mónica Ramírez Almadani  
1999 Avenue of the Stars  
Los Angeles, CA 90067-4643  
Telephone: (424) 332-4800  
Facsimile: (424) 332-4749  
Email: mralmadani@cov.com

Charles F. Robinson  
Margaret Wu  
Julia M. C. Friedlander  
Sonya Sanchez  
Norman Hamill  
Harpreet Chahal  
Michael Troncoso  
University of California  
Office of the General Counsel  
1111 Franklin Street, 8th Floor  
Oakland, CA 94607-5200  
Telephone: + 1 (510) 987-9800  
Facsimile: + 1 (510) 987-9757  
Email: charles.robinson@ucop.edu

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs The Regents of  
the University of California and Janet  
Napolitano, in her official capacity as  
President of the University of  
California*

COTCHETT, PITRE & McCARTHY,  
LLP

Nancy L. Fineman  
nfineman@cpmlegal.com  
Brian Danitz  
bdanitz@cpmlegal.com  
Tamarah P. Prevost  
tprevost@cpmlegal.com  
San Francisco Airport Office Center  
840 Malcolm Road, Suite 200  
Burlingame, CA 94010  
Telephone: (650) 697-6000  
Facsimile: (650) 697-0577

Richard Doyle  
Nora Frimann  
Office of the City Attorney  
200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor  
San José, California 95113  
Telephone: (408) 535-1900  
Facsimile: (408) 998-3131  
E-Mail Address:  
cao.main@sanJoseca.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff City of San Jose*

GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP

Theodore J. Boutrous, Jr.  
tboutrous@gibsondunn.com  
Kirstin Galler  
kgaller@gibsondunn.com  
Jesse S. Gabriel  
jgabriel@gibsondunn.com  
333 South Grand Avenue  
Los Angeles, CA 90071-3197  
Telephone: (213) 229-7000  
Facsimile: (213) 229-7520

Ethan D. Dettmer  
edettmer@gibsondunn.com  
555 Mission Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
Telephone: (415) 393-8200  
Facsimile: (415) 393-8306

PUBLIC COUNSEL  
Mark D. Rosenbaum  
mrosenbaum@publiccounsel.org  
Judy London  
jlondon@publiccounsel.org  
610 South Ardmere Avenue  
Los Angeles, CA 90005  
Telephone: (213) 385-2977  
Facsimile: (213) 385-9089

BARRERA LEGAL GROUP, PLLC  
Luis Cortes Romero  
lcortes@barreralegal.com  
19309 68th Avenue South, Suite R102  
Kent, WA 98032  
Telephone: (253) 872-4730  
Facsimile: (253) 237-1591

James R. Williams, County Counsel  
Greta S. Hansen  
Laura S. Trice  
laura.trice@cco.sccgov.org  
Marcelo Quiñones  
marcelo.quinones@cco.sccgov.org  
Office of the County Counsel  
County of Santa Clara  
70 West Hedding Street  
East Wing, Ninth Floor  
San Jose, CA 95110-1770  
Telephone: (408) 299-5900  
Facsimile: (408) 292-7240

*Attorneys for County of Santa Clara*

Jonathan Weissglass  
jweissglass@altber.com  
Stacey M. Leyton  
sleyton@altber.com  
Eric P. Brown  
ebrown@altber.com  
ALTSHULER BERZON LLP  
177 Post St., Suite 300  
San Francisco, CA 94108  
Telephone: (415) 421-7151  
Facsimile: (415) 362-8064

*Attorneys for County of Santa Clara  
and SEIU Local 521*

Laurence H. Tribe  
larry@tribelaw.com  
Harvard Law School  
\*Affiliation for identification purposes  
only  
1575 Massachusetts Avenue  
Cambridge, MA 02138  
Telephone: (617) 495-1767

Erwin Chemerinsky  
echemerinsky@law.berkeley.edu  
University of California, Berkeley  
School of Law  
\*Affiliation for identification purposes  
only  
215 Boalt Hall  
Berkeley, CA 94720-7200  
Telephone: (510) 642-6483

Leah M. Litman  
llitman@law.uci.edu  
University of California, Irvine School  
of Law  
\*Affiliation for identification purposes  
only  
401 East Peltason Drive  
Irvine, CA 92697  
Telephone: (949) 824-7722

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs Dulce Garcia,  
Miriam Gonzalez Avila, Saul Jimenez  
Suarez, Viridiana Chabolla Mendoza,  
Norma Ramirez, and Jirayut  
Latthivongskorn*

**SIGNATURE CERTIFICATION**

Pursuant to FRAP Circuit Rule 25-5(e), I hereby attest that all other signatories listed, and on whose behalf this filing is submitted, concur in the filing's content and have authorized this filing.

DATED: October 23, 2017

COVINGTON & BURLING LLP

*s/ Jeffrey M. Davidson*  
Jeffrey M. Davidson



## CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE

I hereby certify that this opposition brief complies with the page limit of Ninth Circuit Rule 21-2(c) because the brief does not exceed 30 pages, excluding the parts of the motion exempted by Federal Rule of Appellate Procedure 32(f). I further certify that this motion complies with the typeface and type-style requirements of Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure 27(d)(1)(E), 32(a)(5), and 32(a)(6) because it has been prepared using Microsoft Word 2016 in a proportionally spaced typeface, 14-point Times New Roman font.

DATED: October 23, 2017

COVINGTON & BURLING LLP

*s/ Jeffrey M. Davidson*  
Jeffrey M. Davidson

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on October 23, 2017, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court by using the appellate CM/ECF system. Service has been accomplished via e-mail to the following counsel:

**Counsel for Petitioners:** Mark B. Stern (Mark.Stern@usdoj.gov), Abby C. Wright (Abby.Wright@usdoj.gov), and Thomas Pulham (Thomas.Pulham@usdoj.gov).

The district court has been provided with a copy of this opposition.

*s/ Jeffrey M. Davidson*  
Jeffrey M. Davidson