

NOV 30 2009

MOLLY C. DWYER, CLERK  
U.S. COURT OF APPEALS

NOT FOR PUBLICATION

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS

FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

ROBINSON HAMONANGAN K.  
PASARIBU,

Petitioner,

v.

ERIC H. HOLDER Jr., Attorney General,

Respondent.

No. 07-72023

Agency No. A095-630-017

MEMORANDUM\*

On Petition for Review of an Order of the  
Board of Immigration Appeals

Submitted November 17, 2009\*\*

Before: ALARCÓN, TROTT, and TASHIMA, Circuit Judges.

Robinson Hamonangan K. Pasaribu, a native and citizen of Indonesia,  
petitions for review of the Board of Immigration Appeals' ("BIA") order

---

\* This disposition is not appropriate for publication and is not precedent except as provided by 9th Cir. R. 36-3.

\*\* The panel unanimously finds this case suitable for decision without oral argument. *See* Fed. R. App. P. 34(a)(2).

dismissing his appeal from an immigration judge's decision denying his application for withholding of removal. We have jurisdiction under 8 U.S.C. § 1252. We review for substantial evidence the agency's factual findings, *Cruz-Navarro v. INS*, 232 F.3d 1024, 1028 (9th Cir. 2000), and deny the petition for review.

Substantial evidence supports the BIA's finding that Pasaribu failed to establish past persecution, *see Lim v. INS*, 224 F.3d 929, 936 (9th Cir. 2000) (threats constitute past persecution only when they are "so menacing as to cause significant, actual suffering or harm"), and failed to demonstrate a clear probability of persecution on account of his Christianity, *see Lolong v. Gonzales*, 484 F.3d 1173, 1179 (9th Cir. 2007) (en banc) ("a general, undifferentiated claim" does not make petitioner eligible for relief); *Hakeem v. INS*, 273 F.3d 812, 816-17 (9th Cir. 2001). Accordingly, his withholding of removal claim fails.

**PETITION FOR REVIEW DENIED.**