

FEB 25 2010

MOLLY C. DWYER, CLERK  
U.S. COURT OF APPEALS

NOT FOR PUBLICATION

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS

FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

JOSE JAIME ESCALANTE,

Petitioner,

v.

ERIC H. HOLDER Jr., Attorney General,

Respondent.

No. 07-71975

Agency No. A077-761-002

MEMORANDUM\*

On Petition for Review of an Order of the  
Board of Immigration Appeals

Submitted February 16, 2010\*\*

Before: FERNANDEZ, GOULD, and M. SMITH, Circuit Judges.

Jose Jaime Escalante, a native and citizen of El Salvador, petitions pro se for review of the Board of Immigration Appeals' order dismissing his appeal from an immigration judge's decision denying his application for asylum, withholding of

---

\* This disposition is not appropriate for publication and is not precedent except as provided by 9th Cir. R. 36-3.

\*\* The panel unanimously concludes this case is suitable for decision without oral argument. *See* Fed. R. App. P. 34(a)(2).

removal, and relief under the Convention Against Torture (“CAT”). We have jurisdiction under 8 U.S.C. § 1252. We review for substantial evidence, *Nagoulko v. INS*, 333 F.3d 1012, 1015 (9th Cir. 2003), and we deny the petition for review.

Even if Escalante testified credibly, substantial evidence supports the agency’s denial of Escalante’s asylum claim because the threats made against him did not rise to the level of persecution, *see Lim v. INS*, 224 F.3d 929, 936 (9th Cir. 2000), and he failed to demonstrate that his fear of returning to El Salvador is objectively reasonable, *see Nagoulko*, 333 F.3d at 1018.

Because Escalante failed to establish eligibility for asylum, he necessarily failed to meet the more stringent standard for withholding of removal. *See Mansour v. Ashcroft*, 390 F.3d 667, 673 (9th Cir. 2004).

Substantial evidence also supports the agency’s denial of CAT relief because Escalante failed to establish it is more likely than not that he will be tortured if he returns to El Salvador. *See Singh v. Gonzales*, 439 F.3d 1100, 1113 (9th Cir. 2006).

**PETITION FOR REVIEW DENIED.**