

APR 12 2011

MOLLY C. DWYER, CLERK
U.S. COURT OF APPEALS

NOT FOR PUBLICATION

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS

FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

VERONICA MARICELA CHAVEZ-
BENAVIDES,

Petitioner,

v.

ERIC H. HOLDER, Jr., Attorney General,

Respondent.

No. 10-70270

Agency No. A094-917-247

MEMORANDUM*

On Petition for Review of an Order of the
Board of Immigration Appeals

Submitted April 5, 2011**

Before: B. FLETCHER, CLIFTON, and BEA, Circuit Judges.

Veronica Maricela Chavez-Benavides, a native and citizen of El Salvador, petitions for review of the Board of Immigration Appeals’ (“BIA”) order dismissing her appeal from an immigration judge’s decision denying her applications for asylum and withholding of removal. We have jurisdiction under 8

* This disposition is not appropriate for publication and is not precedent except as provided by 9th Cir. R. 36-3.

** The panel unanimously concludes this case is suitable for decision without oral argument. *See* Fed. R. App. P. 34(a)(2).

U.S.C. § 1252. We review de novo questions of law, *Cerezo v. Mukasey*, 512 F.3d 1163, 1166 (9th Cir. 2008), except to the extent that deference is owed to the BIA's determination of the governing statutes and regulations, *Simeonov v. Ashcroft*, 371 F.3d 532, 535 (9th Cir. 2004). We review for substantial evidence the agency's factual findings. *Santos-Lemus v. Mukasey*, 542 F.3d 738, 742 (9th Cir. 2008). We grant the petition for review and remand.

Substantial evidence supports the BIA's finding that Chavez-Benavides failed to demonstrate that she would be persecuted on the basis of a protected ground as a person returning from the United States who would be perceived to have money. *See Li v. INS*, 92 F.3d 985, 987 (9th Cir. 1996) (individuals with "low economic status" are not a particular social group).

We recently held that the BIA could not reject "all women in Guatemala" as a particular social group solely because it was overly broad and internally diverse. *Perdomo v. Holder*, 611 F.3d 662, 669 (9th Cir. 2010) (remanding for further proceedings). Here, the BIA similarly rejected Chavez-Benavides' social group consisting of young, single women in El Salvador as overly broad and lacking a common, immutable characteristic. In light of our intervening decision in *Perdomo*, we grant Chavez-Benavides' petition for review with respect to her asylum and withholding of removal claims and remand for further proceedings

consistent with this disposition. *See INS v. Ventura*, 537 U.S. 12, 16-18 (2002)
(per curiam).

PETITION FOR REVIEW GRANTED; REMANDED.