

MAR 13 2012

MOLLY C. DWYER, CLERK  
U.S. COURT OF APPEALS

NOT FOR PUBLICATION

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS

FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

ROMAN FEDOROVICH BALCAN,

Petitioner,

v.

ERIC H. HOLDER, Jr., Attorney General,

Respondent.

No. 08-73928

Agency No. A097-599-372

MEMORANDUM\*

On Petition for Review of an Order of the  
Board of Immigration Appeals

Submitted March 6, 2012\*\*

Before: B. FLETCHER, REINHARDT, and TASHIMA, Circuit Judges.

Roman Fedorovich Balcan, a native of the former Soviet Union and citizen of Moldova, petitions for review of the Board of Immigration Appeals' order dismissing his appeal from an immigration judge's decision denying his application for asylum, withholding of removal, and relief under the Convention

---

\* This disposition is not appropriate for publication and is not precedent except as provided by 9th Cir. R. 36-3.

\*\* The panel unanimously concludes this case is suitable for decision without oral argument. *See* Fed. R. App. P. 34(a)(2).

Against Torture (“CAT”). We have jurisdiction under 8 U.S.C. § 1252. We review for substantial evidence factual findings, *Zehatye v. Gonzales*, 453 F.3d 1182, 1184-85 (9th Cir. 2006), and we deny the petition for review.

Substantial evidence supports the agency’s finding that Balcan failed to demonstrate the harassment he and his family suffered under the Soviet regime, and the incidents in 2002 and 2007 when they were prevented from holding religious events, rise to the level of past persecution. *See Nagoulko v. INS*, 333 F.3d 1012, 1016 (9th Cir. 2003). Substantial evidence also supports the agency’s finding that Balcan does not have a well-founded fear of future persecution. *See id.* at 1018. Accordingly, Balcan’s asylum claim fails.

Because Balcan failed to meet the lower burden of proof for asylum, it follows that he has not met the higher standard for withholding of removal. *See Zehatye*, 453 F.3d at 1190.

Finally, substantial evidence also supports the agency’s denial of CAT relief because Balcan failed to establish that it is more likely than not he will be tortured by or with the acquiescence of the government of Moldova. *See Silaya v. Mukasey*, 524 F.3d 1066, 1073 (9th Cir. 2008).

**PETITION FOR REVIEW DENIED.**