

MAY 24 2012

MOLLY C. DWYER, CLERK  
U.S. COURT OF APPEALS

NOT FOR PUBLICATION

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS

FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

SHAWNDEE HARTLESS, on Behalf of  
Herself and All Others Similarly Situated  
and the General Public,

Plaintiff - Appellee,

v.

CLOROX COMPANY,

Defendant - Appellee.

-----  
SONIA NEWMAN,

Objector-Appellant.

No. 11-55136

D.C. No. 3:06-cv-02705-CAB

MEMORANDUM\*

SHAWNDEE HARTLESS, on Behalf of  
Herself and All Others Similarly Situated  
and the General Public,

Plaintiff - Appellee,

v.

CLOROX COMPANY,

Defendant - Appellee.

No. 11-55150

D.C. No. 3:06-cv-02705-CAB

\* This disposition is not appropriate for publication and is not precedent except as provided by Ninth Circuit Rule 36-3.

OMAR RIVERO,

Objector - Appellant.

SHAWNDEE HARTLESS, on Behalf of  
Herself and All Others Similarly Situated  
and the General Public,

Plaintiff - Appellee,

v.

CLOROX COMPANY,

Defendant - Appellee.

SAM P. CANNATA,

Objector - Appellant.

No. 11-55189

D.C. No. 3:06-cv-02705-CAB

Appeal from the United States District Court  
for the Southern District of California  
Cathy Ann Bencivengo, Magistrate Judge, Presiding

Argued and Submitted May 10, 2012  
Pasadena, California

Before: PREGERSON, GRABER, and BERZON, Circuit Judges.

Objectors Sonia Newman, Omar Rivero, and Sam P. Cannata appeal the district court's class certification in this class action brought by lead Plaintiff Shawndee Hartless against Defendant Clorox Company. The district court did not abuse its discretion in certifying the settlement class. See Parra v. Bashas', Inc., 536 F.3d 975, 977–78 (9th Cir. 2008) (stating the standard of review). On this record, the court was not required to divide the nationwide class into sub-classes, as the Objectors wish.

**AFFIRMED.**