

NOV 09 2015

MOLLY C. DWYER, CLERK  
U.S. COURT OF APPEALS

NOT FOR PUBLICATION

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS

FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

<p>LIZHEN ZHANG,</p> <p>Petitioner,</p> <p>v.</p> <p>LORETTA E. LYNCH, Attorney General,</p> <p>Respondent.</p>
---

No. 13-70115

B.I.A. No. A099-736-635

MEMORANDUM\*

On Petition for Review of an Order of the  
Board of Immigration Appeals

Submitted November 5, 2015\*\*  
Pasadena, California

Before: GRABER and GOULD, Circuit Judges, and DANIEL,\*\*\* Senior District Judge.

Petitioner Lizhen Zhang seeks review of the Board of Immigration Appeals' ("BIA") denial of her claims for asylum, withholding of removal, and relief under

---

\* This disposition is not appropriate for publication and is not precedent except as provided by 9th Cir. R. 36-3.

\*\* The panel unanimously concludes that this case is suitable for decision without oral argument. Fed. R. App. P. 34(a)(2).

\*\*\* The Honorable Wiley Y. Daniel, Senior United States District Judge for the District of Colorado, sitting by designation.

the Convention Against Torture ("CAT"). For the reasons stated below, we deny the petition.

Substantial evidence supports the immigration judge's ("IJ") adverse credibility finding, which the BIA affirmed. See Ren v. Holder, 648 F.3d 1079, 1084–85 (9th Cir. 2011) (explaining the standard of review under the REAL ID Act). The BIA permissibly found Petitioner incredible given that Petitioner was inconsistent in her testimony regarding whether and when she had an intrauterine device inserted. Moreover, Petitioner failed to present specific documentary evidence that independently established her claims. See Al-Harbi v. INS, 242 F.3d 882, 891 (9th Cir. 2001) (holding that "documentary evidence pertaining to the asylum applicant himself and to the events in which he was involved . . . can independently establish facts essential to . . . an asylum claim"). The BIA, therefore, properly denied Petitioner's claims for asylum, withholding of removal, and CAT relief.

**Petition DENIED.**