

**FILED**

**MAY 09 2006**

**CATHY A. CATTERSON, CLERK  
U.S. COURT OF APPEALS**

**FOR PUBLICATION**

**UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS**

**FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT**

MERRILL LYNCH, PIERCE, FENNER  
AND SMITH, INCORPORATED, a  
corporation organized and existing under  
the laws of the State of Delaware with its  
principal place of business in New York,  
New York,

Plaintiff - Appellee,

v.

ENC CORPORATION; SUNTRUST  
INVESTMENT CO., S.A., a corporation  
organized and existing under the laws of  
Switzerland with an address at rue de  
Jargonnant 2, P.O. Box 76, 1211 Geneva 6,  
Switzerland; JOHN K. BURNS, a citizen  
of the United States, with an address at 300  
Wacker Drive, Suite, 900, Chicago,  
Illinois, 60606; THE ESTATE OF  
FERDINAND E. MARCOS; IMELDA R.  
MARCOS; FERDINAND R. MARCOS,  
JR.; MARIA IMELDA MARCOS; IRENE  
MARCOS ARANETA; FRONTIER RISK  
CAPITAL MANAGEMENT, L.C.C., a  
limited liability company organized and  
existing under the laws of the States of  
Nevada, with a registered office at 6100  
Neil Road, Suite 500, Reno, NV. 89511  
and an address at 300 Wacker Drive, Suite  
900, Chicago, IL 60606; GROSVENOR

No. 04-16401

D.C. No. CV-00-00595-MLR

ORDER AMENDING  
OPINION

CAPITAL LTD., a company organized and existing under the law of the United Kingdom, with an address at Grosvenor Gardens House, Suite 117, 35-37 Grosvenor Gardens, London SW1 W OBS, United Kingdom; THE ESTATE OF ROGER ROXAS; GOLDEN BUDHA CORPORATION, a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Georgia, with a registered office at 710 West First Street, Blue Ridge, Georgia 30513, and a mailing address at 260 Carrollton St., Buchanan, GA 30113,

Defendants,

and,

ARELMA, INC., a corporation organized and existing under the laws of Panama with a permanent address at Ave. Justo Alosemena y Calle 41 Este, No. 40-59 Pte al Colegio Immaculada, Panama 1.Rep.de Panama, and a mailing address at c/o Suntrust Investment Co.S.A., ru de Jargonnant 2, P.O. Box 76, 1211 Geneva 6, Switzerland;,

Defendant - Appellant,

MARIANO J. PIMENTAL, on behalf of himself and all other persons similarly situated;,

Defendant - Appellee,

PHILIPPINE NATIONAL BANK,

Defendant - Appellant.

MERRILL LYNCH, PIERCE, FENNER AND SMITH, INCORPORATED, a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Delaware with its principal place of business in New York, New York,

Plaintiff - Appellee,

v.

ENC CORPORATION; ARELMA, INC., a corporation organized and existing under the laws of Panama with a permanent address at Ave. Justo Alosemena y Calle 41 Este, No. 40-59 Pte al Colegio Immeclada, Panama 1.Rep.de Panama, and a mailing address at c/o Suntrust Investment Co.S.A., ru de Jargonant 2, P.O. Box 76, 1211 Geneva 6, Switzerland; SUNTRUST INVESTMENT CO., S.A., a corporation organized and existing under the laws of Switzerland with an address at rue de Jargonant 2, P.O. Box 76, 1211 Geneva 6, Switzerland; JOHN K. BURNS, a citizen of the United States, with an address at 300 Wacker Drive, Suite, 900, Chicago, Illinois, 60606; THE ESTATE OF FERDINAND E. MARCOS; IMELDA R. MARCOS; FERDINAND R. MARCOS, JR.; MARIA IMELDA MARCOS; IRENE MARCOS ARANETA; FRONTIER RISK CAPITAL MANAGEMENT, L.C.C., a limited liability company organized and existing

No. 04-16503

D.C. No. CV-00-00595-MLR

under the laws of the States of Nevada, with a registered office at 6100 Neil Road, Suite 500, Reno, NV. 89511 and an address at 300 Wacker Drive, Suite 900, Chicago, IL 60606; GROSVENOR CAPITAL LTD., a company organized and existing under the law of the United Kingdom, with an address at Grosvenor Gardens House, Suite 117, 35-37 Grosvenor Gardens, London SW1 W OBS, United Kingdom; THE ESTATE OF ROGER ROXAS; GOLDEN BUDHA CORPORATION, a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Georgia, with a registered office at 710 West First Street, Blue Ridge, Georgia 30513, and a mailing address at 260 Carrollton St., Buchanan, GA 30113; PHILIPPINE NATIONAL BANK,

Defendants,

and,

MARIANO J. PIMENTAL, on behalf of himself and all other persons similarly situated;

Defendant - Appellee,

REPUBLIC OF THE PHILIPPINES;  
PRESIDENTIAL COMMISSION ON  
GOOD GOVERNMENT, a government  
agency of the Republic of the Philippines,

Defendants - Appellants.

MERRILL LYNCH, PIERCE, FENNER AND SMITH, INCORPORATED, a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Delaware with its principal place of business in New York, New York,

Plaintiff - Appellee,

v.

ENC CORPORATION; ARELMA, INC., a corporation organized and existing under the laws of Panama with a permanent address at Ave. Justo Alosemena y Calle 41 Este, No. 40-59 Pte al Colegio Immeclada, Panama 1.Rep.de Panama, and a mailing address at c/o Suntrust Investment Co.S.A., ru de Jargonnant 2, P.O. Box 76, 1211 Geneva 6, Switzerland; SUNTRUST INVESTMENT CO., S.A., a corporation organized and existing under the laws of Switzerland with an address at rue de Jargonnant 2, P.O. Box 76, 1211 Geneva 6, Switzerland; JOHN K. BURNS, a citizen of the United States, with an address at 300 Wacker Drive, Suite, 900, Chicago, Illinois, 60606; THE ESTATE OF FERDINAND E. MARCOS; IMELDA R. MARCOS; FERDINAND R. MARCOS, JR.; MARIA IMELDA MARCOS; IRENE MARCOS ARANETA; FRONTIER RISK CAPITAL MANAGEMENT, L.C.C., a limited liability company organized and existing under the laws of the States of Nevada, with a registered office at 6100 Neil Road, Suite 500, Reno, NV. 89511 and an

No. 04-16538

D.C. No. CV-00-00595-MLR

address at 300 Wacker Drive, Suite 900,  
Chicago, IL 60606; GROSVENOR  
CAPITAL LTD., a company organized and  
existing under the law of the United  
Kingdom, with an address at Grosvenor  
Gardens House, Suite 117, 35-37  
Grosvenor Gardens, London SW1 W OBS,  
United Kingdom; PHILIPPINE  
NATIONAL BANK; REPUBLIC OF THE  
PHILIPPINES; PRESIDENTIAL  
COMMISSION ON GOOD  
GOVERNMENT, a government agency of  
the Republic of the Philippines,

Defendants,

and,

THE ESTATE OF ROGER ROXAS;  
GOLDEN BUDHA CORPORATION, a  
corporation organized and existing under  
the laws of the State of Georgia, with a  
registered office at 710 West First Street,  
Blue Ridge, Georgia 30513, and a mailing  
address at 260 Carrollton St., Buchanan,  
GA 30113;

Defendants - Appellants,

MARIANO J. PIMENTAL, on behalf of  
himself and all other persons similarly  
situated,

Defendant - Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court  
for the District of Hawaii

Manuel L. Real, District Judge, Presiding

Argued and Submitted March 14, 2005  
San Francisco, California

Before: NOONAN, THOMAS, Circuit Judges, and ROBERT\*, District Judge.

The opinion filed on May 4, 2006, is amended as follows: on slip opinion page 5038, lines 29-32, the following sentence is deleted: “The phrase ‘equity and good conscience’ in our judicial usage is coterminous with the first opinions of the United States Supreme Court. *See Hollingsworth v. Ogle*, 1 U.S. 257 (1788).”

On slip opinion page 5038, line 29, the following sentence is added: “The phrase ‘equity and good conscience’ in our judicial usage is coterminous with the early opinions of the United States Supreme Court. *See Elmendorf v. Taylor*, 23 U.S. (10 Wheat.) 152, 181 (1825).”

---

\* The Honorable James L. Robart, United States District Judge for the Western District of Washington, sitting by designation.